

## MINUTES ADOPTED BY THE GREENVILLE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

October 25, 2016

The Greenville Historic Preservation Commission held a meeting on the above date at 6:00 p.m. in Council Chambers of City Hall located at 200 West Fifth Street.

### **COMMISSION MEMBERS PRESENT:**

JEREMY JORDAN-CHAIR  
KERRY CARLIN  
TYRONE WALSTON

JAKE POSTMA  
ELIZABETH WOOTEN  
MYRON CASPAR

**STAFF MEMBERS PRESENT:** COLLETTE KINANE, PLANNER II; AMY NUNEZ, SECRETARY AND BEN GRIFFITH, COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR

**OTHERS PRESENT:** DONALD PHILLIPS, ASSISTANT CITY ATTORNEY AND KELVIN THOMAS, COMMUNICATIONS TECHNICIAN

### **ADDITIONS/DELETIONS TO AGENDA**

Chairman Jordan stated staff indicated that item #3 FIGs under New Business has been tabled.

**Mr. Postma made a motion to accept the amended agenda, Mr. Carlin seconded and it passed unanimously.**

### **APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

**Mr. Postma made a motion to accept the September 27, 2016 minutes as written, Mr. Caspar seconded and it passed unanimously.**

### **NEW BUSINESS**

#### **Minor Works COAs**

2016-20: 303 S. Library Street; Bruce Sauter; Roof replacement/hurricane damage – Approved

#### **Major Works COAs**

2016-11: 1004 E. 3<sup>rd</sup> Street. Applicant: Jenniss Harrell/Olde Towne Construction.  
After the Fact roof replacement/balustrade removal.

Ms. Kinane presented the staff report. The applicant proposes the replacement of asbestos shingles with architectural shingles and replacement of current rubber roof with EPDM rubber roof. Applicant also proposes the removal of the balustrade. This is an After the Fact COA.

The property at 1004 E. 3<sup>rd</sup> Street is the Bilbro House (circa 1940), a frame two-story house, is the only Mount Vernon replica in the district. Dominated by a two tiered front porch with roofline

balustrade, the porch is engaged and shelters a five-bay front façade. Double shouldered chimneys are centrally located on gable ends and flanked by attic-level quarter-round ventilators. A small gabled wing projects from the west elevation and a large gable-roof addition projects from the rear. The addition replicates the roofline balustrade on the front façade. Located behind the house is a contributing 1940s garage that features a gable roof with a single portal and small shed addition on the west elevation. Both structures are covered with aluminum siding. This application is for the replacement of an asbestos 'slate-like' shingle roof with lifetime architectural shingles and a rubber roof with an EPDM rubber roof. The application also calls for the removal of the decorative balustrade. The roof and balustrade are original to the structure and significant due to the structure's representation of its time period and its Mount Vernon inspiration. The property is located at the corner of S. Harding and E. 3<sup>rd</sup> Streets. The shingles replacement are similar but different because the original is not available.

For this application, **Design Guidelines** 1-3 of Chapter 2 Roofs (pages 20-21) are applicable.

**Recommendation:**

If this application had been submitted properly, staff would have advocated for the repair of the original roof. Due to the fact that the request was made after-the-fact and as the asbestos tiles were broken in their removal and are no longer available, staff recommends the roofing material be of similar shape, size, and color as the original. The removal of the balustrade must be reversed, as the balustrade is vital to the house's Mount Vernon aesthetic and character. The balustrade should be reinstalled in the same pattern and material.

The Design Review Committee met and recommends approval of the re-roofing, contingent upon staff approval of color, shape, and size of the shingles as compared to the original. The Committee also recommends that the balustrade must be restored.

Chairman Jordan opened the public hearing.

Mr. Jenniss Harrell spoke in favor of the request. He stated he was unaware of the property being in the historic district. He stated that the work was under the dollar amount needed for a building permit. If he had known, he would have complied and is willing to comply now with the Commission's decision. The replacement shingles are comparable. He stated the balustrade was rotten and allowed water to penetrate the roof decking and that's why it was removed.

No one spoke in opposition.

Chairman Jordan closed the public hearing and opened for board discussion.

Chairman Jordan read the **Finding of Facts** for application #2016-11 1004 E. 3<sup>rd</sup> Street, parcel number 01519.

*The after-the-fact COA application was completed and submitted on September 15, 2016. The application is for roof replacement and balustrade removal. A notice of the hearing was*

*published in the Daily Reflector on October 17 and October 24, 2016. A notice was mailed out to surrounding property owners on October 7, 2016. This hearing was held on October 25, 2016. Collette Kinane presented for the City and Jenniss Harrell presented for the applicant. For this application, Design Guidelines #1-3 of Chapter 2: Roofs are applicable. The replacement of shingles is found to be congruent with the applicable guidelines. The removal of the balustrade is found to be not congruent with the applicable guidelines.*

**Mr. Carlin made a motion to adopt the findings of facts, Ms. Wooten seconded and the motion passed unanimously.**

Chairman Jordan stated the condition to be imposed is to replace the balustrade with wood/similar materials. Commission members agreed.

**Ms. Wooten made a motion to approve the application with the condition that the balustrade be replaced with wood/similar materials. Mr. Walston seconded and the motion passed unanimously.**

Mr. Harrell asked how long he had to do the work.

Ms. Kinane stated the COA application is good for six months.

2016-12: 310 South Harding Street. Applicant: Myron Caspar.  
Window replacement.

Commission Member Myron Caspar requested to recuse himself since he is the applicant.

**Mr. Carlin made a motion to recuse Mr. Caspar from this item, seconded by Mr. Postma, and the motion passed unanimously.**

Ms. Kinane presented the staff report. The applicant proposes the replacement of five deteriorated aluminum-clad Pella casement windows with aluminum-clad casement windows. The property at 310 South Harding Street is the William Stuart Bost House (circa 1940), a brick gable-end dwelling is one-and-a-half stories in height and has three gable-roof dormers with casement windows. The house is distinguished by a recessed full-façade front porch. A large brick wing is located on the north elevation. A small, modern solarium is attached to the south elevation. The elaborate foliated metal porch and spandrels may be replacements. The house was built for William S. Bost, president of the Person-Garrett Tobacco Company. This application is for the replacement of five aluminum-clad Pella casement windows with aluminum-clad casement windows. Mr. Caspar estimates that the windows to be replaced were installed in the '70s or '80s.

For this application, **Design Guidelines** 2, 5, and 6 of Chapter 2 Windows and Doors (pages 35-36) are applicable.

**Recommendation:**

This application is for the replacement of previously replaced windows with the same exact type and manufacturer. This is technically in-kind; however it is unknown whether these replacements match the original windows. There is no existing documentation on the original appearance of the house and these windows. Staff recommends approval.

The Design Review Committee met and recommends approval of the application.

Chairman Jordan opened the public hearing.

Mr. Myron Caspar spoke in favor of the request. He stated there are five rotten windows that he would like to replace with similar windows.

Chairman Jordan stated that the existing windows were replaced before the area became a historic district.

Ms. Camille Smith, neighbor, spoke in favor. She stated she had no issues with the request.

No one spoke in opposition.

Chairman Jordan close the public hearing and opened for board discussion.

Chairman Jordan read the **Finding of Facts** for application #2016-12 310 South Harding Street, parcel number 03912.

*The COA application was completed and submitted on October 6, 2016. The application is for five casement window replacements. A notice of the hearing was published in the Daily Reflector on October 17 and October 24, 2016. A notice was mailed out to surrounding property owners on October 7, 2016. This hearing was held on October 25, 2016. Collette Kinane presented for the City and Myron Caspar presented for the applicant. For this application, Design Guidelines #2, 5, and 6 of Chapter 2: Windows and Doors are applicable. The replacement of windows is found to be congruent with the applicable guidelines.*

**Mr. Walston made a motion to adopt the findings of facts, Mr. Postma seconded and the motion passed unanimously.**

**Ms. Postma made a motion to approve the application, Ms. Wooten seconded and the motion passed unanimously.**

Mr. Caspar rejoined the Commission.

**November Meeting**

Ms. Kinane stated that the November HPC meeting is scheduled for Tuesday the 22<sup>nd</sup> which is two days before Thanksgiving. She asked if the Commission wanted to change.

Mr. Caspar stated he would not be present on November 22<sup>nd</sup>.

Mr. Carlin stated he would not be present on November 22<sup>nd</sup> and stated that Ms. Arnold would probably not be present.

Ms. Kinane stated that the following dates were available: November 14<sup>th</sup>, 28<sup>th</sup>, 29<sup>th</sup> and 30<sup>th</sup>.

Mr. Carlin, Ms. Wooten and Mr. Caspar stated they preferred November 14<sup>th</sup>.

**Mr. Postma made a motion to cancel the November 22, 2016 HPC meeting, seconded by Mr. Carlin, and the motion passed unanimously.**

**Mr. Postma made a motion to have a Special Meeting on November 14, 2016, seconded by Mr. Carlin, and the motion passed unanimously.**

#### **PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD**

No public comment made.

#### **COMMITTEE REPORTS**

##### *Design Review Committee*

Chairman Jordan stated they met to consider the COAs and FIGs on tonight's agenda.

##### *Publicity Committee*

Mr. Postma stated they met. He stated they do have one current brochure available to use now. He provided a new handout that listed possible topic for presentations. He encouraged all members to get involved. He suggested choosing a few topics so that standard presentations could be prepared. He will facilitate the process but needs the members to volunteer to prepare and present.

Topics: 1. Threatened historic buildings in Greenville 2. History of the Greenville Town Common 3. The unique architectural craftsmanship of buildings in Greenville 4. History of Greenville's Central Business District 5. The College View Historic District 6. The Skinnerville Historic District 7. The Dickinson Avenue Historic District.

Mr. Carlin stated he like #3 regarding unique elements throughout the City.

Ms. Wooten stated interest in the #7 Dickinson Avenue and #2 Town Commons. She asked if there was material was already available on these topics.

Ms. Kinane stated the digital library at the Joyner Library has many photos available. Also the Parks and Recreation Department might have a presentation available on Town Commons.

Chairman Jordan asked Ms. Kinane to email the Commissioners regarding volunteering on topic numbers 2, 3 and 7.

*Selection Committee*

Chairman Jordan stated they did not meet.

**ANNOUNCEMENTS**

Ms. Kinane stated an updated attendance policy for Boards and Commissions was left at the Commissioners' seats for review and signature. She stated that in their packets was historic district information from the Horizon 2026 Plan. She mentioned the Historical Marker Program was having a community meeting on Thursday October 27<sup>th</sup> at 6pm at the Sadie Saulter Elementary School.

**With there being no further discussion, Mr. Carlin made a motion to adjourn, Ms. Wooten seconded, and it motion passed unanimously. The meeting adjourned at 6:36 pm.**

Respectfully Submitted,

Collette Kinane, Planner II