

## **GREENVILLE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES**

May 27, 2008  
Greenville, NC

The Greenville Historic Preservation Commission held a meeting on the above date at 7:00 p.m. in the City Council Chambers of City Hall located at 200 West Fifth Street.

### **COMMISSION MEMBERS PRESENT:**

Dennis Chestnut	Franceine Rees	Rick Smiley
Jeremy Jordan	Dale Sauter	
Candace Pearce, Chair	N. Yaprak Savut	

### **COMMISSION MEMBERS ABSENT:**

Greg Jarrell, Vice-Chair                      Richard Weir

**STAFF MEMBERS PRESENT:** Sandy Gale Edmundson, Secretary; Jonathan Edwards, Cameraman; Les Everett, Chief Building Inspector; Bill Little, Assistant City Attorney; Carl Rees, Senior Planner; and Tom Wisemiller, Planner

**OTHERS PRESENT:** Calvin Mercer, City Council Liaison and F. Bruce Sauter

### **ADDITIONS/DELETIONS TO THE AGENDA**

Motion was made by Mr. Jeremy Jordan and seconded by Ms. N. Yaprak Savut to add the reading of the resolution requesting additional staffing from the Community Development to be assigned to the Historic Preservation Commission. Motion carried unanimously.

### **APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF APRIL 22, 2008**

Motion was made by Ms. N. Yaprak Savut and seconded by Mr. Dale Sauter to approve the April 22, 2008 minutes. Motion carried unanimously.

### **2008 HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION AWARDS PRESENTATION**

Ms. Pearce: The Historic Preservation Commission Awards are presented every two years by the Greenville Historic Preservation Commission to honor leaders in the community dedicated to preserving and promoting Greenville's heritage resources. The Greenville Historic Preservation Commission is a quasi-judicial body charged with protecting Greenville's historic properties. I would like to ask City Council Liaison Calvin Mercer to present the 2008 Historic Preservation Commission Awards.

City Council Liaison Calvin Mercer:

**The Sallie Southall Cotton Award** is conferred on women who have made important contributions to historic preservation in Greenville. Born in Virginia in 1846, Sallie Southall Cotton was educated in North Carolina and lived most of her life in the Greenville area. A leader in the women's movement, Mrs. Cotton helped found the North Carolina Federation of Women's Clubs, was a participant in the National Congress of Mothers; and in 1899 founded Greenville's End of the Century Club.

**The 2008 Sallie Southall Cotton Award** is presented to **Drucilla York** for expanding knowledge of Greenville's historic assets. An architectural historian, Ms. York, wrote local landmark survey and research reports for the Charles O'Hagan Horne, Sr. House, the Sheppard Memorial Library, and the historic City Hall (now Municipal Building). She also researched Greenville's Lustron House. Ms. York and her husband, Maury York – Associate Director for East Carolina University's (ECU) Joyner Library Special Collections – are residents of the Green Springs/East 5<sup>th</sup> Street neighborhood. Both are active in promoting and preserving their neighborhood as well as Greenville's history and heritage assets.

**The Robert Lee Humber Award** is conferred on professionals or organizations that have contributed to historic preservation in Greenville. A renowned scholar, Dr. Humber held degrees from Wake Forest College and Harvard University and was a Rhodes Scholar. After spending much of his adult life in Paris, Dr. Humber returned to Greenville in 1940, where he established the Movement for World Federation and the State Museum of Art. Active in historic preservation, Dr. Humber was a charter member of the North Carolina Society for the Preservation of Antiquities, first life member of the North Carolina Literary and Historical Association, and President (1964-68) of the Pitt County Historic Association.

**The 2008 Robert Lee Humber Award** is presented to **T. Scott Batchelor** of The Daily Reflector for raising awareness of historic preservation issues in the Greenville community. As a reporter of The Daily Reflector, Mr. Batchelor has written numerous incisive articles on historic preservation related topics. These stories have highlighted threats to local historic resources, revealed opportunities and obstacles associated with revitalization of historic buildings and districts, and raised the profile of the Historic Preservation Commission. In the process, Mr. Batchelor's stories have also helped to make local preservation efforts more effective.

**The Architectural Award for Restoration Excellence** is awarded to individuals, organizations, or companies responsible for the significant restoration of a residential or commercial building. In past years, the Award has celebrated the restoration of cherished local landmarks: Globe Hardware and the Moye House. The City of Greenville owes a debt of gratitude to those who have expended the money, effort, and will to refurbish the city's architectural gems.

**The 2008 Architectural Award for Restoration Excellence** is presented to **Self-Help Credit Union** for its \$2 million rehabilitation and adaptive reuse of the Proctor Hotel (1912) as the Self-Help Center – which added 28,000 square feet of modern office and commercial space to the corner of Evans and 4<sup>th</sup> Street in the National Register Downtown Commercial District. The project utilized federal and state historic tax credits and two Façade Improvement Grants. Many significant architectural features were restored as part of the renovation: wood and glass storefronts replicated the original ground floor retail appearance of the building; the original tile floor in the lobby was preserved and the decorative panel moldings were replicated on the lobby walls.

**The Stewardship Award for Preservation Commitment** is awarded to individuals, organizations, or companies that have made a commitment to maintaining the long-term vitality and architectural character of historic buildings in the City of Greenville. The Award is in recognition of those quiet, steady stewards who look after Greenville's precious historic resources on a yearly basis.

**The 2008 Stewardship Award for Preservation Commitment** is presented to **Zeta Tau Alpha Fraternity Housing Corporation, Iota Rho Chapter** for steadfast maintenance and care of the E. B. Ficklen House. When Zeta purchased the property in 1989, it was in poor condition. Among others, Beth Caron, a Zeta from Phi Chapter at Duke University and engineer with Proctor and Gamble, was instrumental in bringing the property back to its former glory. Built in 1902 for local tobaccoist E. B. Ficklen, the house is a fine example of the Queen Anne style – the most elaborately detailed of its type remaining in Greenville. It is distinguished by expansive porches, a tall corner tower, and projecting gable. Thanks to Zeta's stewardship of the E. B. Ficklen House, and Zeta and the Greenville community can enjoy a cherished local landmark for decades to come.

### **IMPERIAL TOBACCO WAREHOUSE UPDATE**

The Commission asked that a letter from the Chair be sent to the property owner asking that all possible avenues for saving the existing portions of the property be explored before wholesale demolition takes place and saving the smokestack for it has towered over the City for nearly a century. Please and the water tower at the burned Imperial Tobacco Warehouse site.

Motion was made by Dr. Dennis Chestnut and seconded by Ms. N. Yaprak Savut to initiate a formal plea to the owner of the Imperial Tobacco Warehouse to save the smokestack. Motion carried unanimously.

**CONSIDERATION FOR APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS**

**COA Application 08-08 (409 South Library Street)**

Ms. Pearce: COA application 08-08 is for 409 South Library Street. Mr. F. Bruce Sauter is submitting an application to install a garage door; repair and repaint the garage walls.

The Notary Public, Sandy Gale Edmundson, swore in Mr. F. Bruce Sauter and Mr. Tom Wisemiller.

Mr. Wisemiller: The dwelling on the property is a one-story brick Craftsman Bungalow with gable roof oriented toward the street. The two front gables have wood shingles and knee braces. A cross gable-roof porch covers three quarters of the front façade has a low apron wall, is supported by massive paneled wood posts on brick piers, and has been screened. A course of brick laid in a soldier pattern delineates the foundation line.

The property is located on the east side of Library Street, about a third of a block north of Fifth Street, in the College View Historic District.

The applicants request approval to install a garage door on an existing free standing garage on the rear of the property. The applicant also proposes to repoint the garage’s masonry concrete wall joints and to repaint the walls in white.

**Considerations**

The applicant proposes to install an overhead “carriage house” steel door on the garage, and to repoint the exterior concrete block walls and repaint them in the same color - white. The garage appears to have been constructed in the 1950s - a few decades after the 1929 dwelling was built. The garage had been poorly maintained over the decades: the exterior walls have holes and cracked mortar joints. According to applicant, an A-frame shingle roof was installed over the previously existing flat metal roof, which was damaged by fire and later removed. The garage opening is approximately 9 feet wide by 7 feet high. To the left of the opening is a small six-paned window.

The proposed steel garage door would not include any glass (see attached brochure, “Courtyard Collection,” item 162-Z) because its main purpose is to improve the garage’s security. The color of the garage door would be white to match the garage.

<u>Chapter</u>	<u>Title</u>	<u>Pages</u>
4	Driveways & Offstreet Parking	60-61

- **1.** Retain and preserve historic garages and outbuildings.

- **2.** Retain and preserve all architectural features that are character-defining elements of garages and outbuildings, including foundations, steps, roof form, windows, doors, architectural trim, and lattices.
- **3.** Retain and preserve historic garage and outbuilding materials, such as siding, masonry, roofing material, and wooden trim. If replacement is necessary, use new materials that match the historic materials in composition, dimension, shape, color, pattern, and texture. Consider substitute materials only if the original materials are not technically feasible.
- **4.** Protect and maintain garages and outbuildings in appropriate ways:
  1. Check to condition of all wooden elements regularly for signs of water damage or rot.
  2. Keep wooden joinery adequately sealed to avoid moisture damage.
  3. Inspect masonry piers or foundation walls regularly for signs of deterioration or moisture damage.
  4. Follow the guidelines for maintenance of masonry, wood, or architectural metals where appropriate.
- **11.** Modern garage doors shall be decided upon a case-by-case basis.

Ms. Pearce: Would the applicant like to speak?

Mr. Sauter: I would like to add an overhead garage door to an existing garage at 409 South Library Street. The main purpose of the door is for security. The garage is a free standing structure at the end of the driveway which runs along the south side of the residence. It currently does not have a door. The opening is approximately 9 feet wide by 7 feet high that is a standard opening. I am proposing to install one of the "Courtyard Collection" doors, similar to the one referred to as a "Carriage Door." The color will be white, matching the color of the garage. The door will not have any glass.

Ms. Pearce: Does anyone have any questions for the applicant? Would anyone like to speak in support or against the application? What is staff's recommendation?

Mr. Wisemiller: Staff recommends that the Historic Preservation Commission *approve* the Certificate of Appropriateness to install a garage door and to repoint and repaint exterior walls, based on the following findings:

- Modern garage doors are to be decided upon a case-by-case basis. In this case, the proposed overhead steel "carriage house" door would not detract from character-defining features of the property. Except for its location at the end of the driveway, the garage in this case is not characteristic of the original garages, smaller outbuildings, and carriage houses that survive in the district; it does not echo the materials, the details, and the roof form of the main house on the site and does not contribute to the architectural character of the district. Consequently, the question would be whether the proposed modern garage door is compatible with, and appropriate for, the property and the district. In the opinion of staff, it is appropriate.

- The applicant proposes to preserve the existing garage – including the existing window and door opening – and to repair the deteriorated masonry walls

**Recommended Motion: Approve request to install overhead steel “carriage house” garage door, repoint masonry walls, and repaint the walls in white**

Mr. Smiley: What is the Design Review Committee’s recommendation?

Mr. Jordan: The Design Review Committee recommended approval of the installation of the overhead steel carriage house garage door as well as the repointing of the masonry walls and repainting the walls in white.

Ms. Pearce: Would anyone else like to speak? I would now like to close the public hearing.

Motion was made by Mr. Rick Smiley and seconded by Mr. Jeremy Jordan that the Finding of Facts are in congruence with the Design Guidelines. Motion carried unanimously.

Motion was made by Mr. Rick Smiley and seconded by Mr. Jeremy Jordan to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness application 08-08 for 409 South Library Street. Motion carried unanimously.

## **COMMITTEE REPORTS**

### Design Review Committee

The Design Review Committee discussed the overhead “carriage house” steel door on the garage, and to repoint the exterior concrete block walls and repaint them in the same color – white.

### Selection Committee

The Selection Committee did not meet.

### Publicity Committee

The Publicity Committee did not meet.

## **NEW BUSINESS**

### **Report on Façade Improvement Grant Program**

Mr. Rees gave the Commission a report of the approved Façade Improvement Grant Program. The beginning date of the program was 1998. The beneficiaries of the program were owners or tenants who restore or revitalize buildings in the downtown core area. The total funds available for spending were: from 1999-2000 would be \$25,000.00; from 2000-2001 would be \$33,075.00; from 2001-2002 would be \$27,500.00; from 2002-2003 would be no funds; from 2003-2004 would be \$35,000.00; from 2004-2005 would be \$25,000.00; from 2005-2006 would be \$35,000.00; from 2006-2007 would be \$35,000.00; and from 2007-2008 would be \$53,955.94. The total grant amount approved is \$220,018.18, the total amount reimbursed is \$159,017.65, and the total of receipts for work completed is \$765,417.48.

### **Revision to Design Guidelines: Driveways and Offstreet Parking (First Reading)**

Mr. Little: Please find the revision to the Design Guidelines: Driveways and Offstreet Parking. Tonight will be the first reading and the second reading and adoption should occur on June 23, 2008 unless continued by majority vote. Approval is by majority vote.

### **AMENDED: Chapter 4 New Construction and Additions – Driveways and Offstreet Parking**

New driveways should be compatible with historically appropriate driveways in spacing, width, configuration, and paving material. They should be introduced in locations that do not compromise historic site features, including landscaping, walkways, and retaining walls.

Because the historic district is predominately residential, large scale off-street parking areas are not typical. The introduction of additional off-street parking must be weighed carefully and should only be considered if the parking area can be located unobtrusively in the rear yard or rear side yard, can be visually screened from the street and adjoining properties, will not abut the house, and will not destroy the residential character of the site by eliminating significant landscape features or a substantial portion of the rear yard.

Proposals for new driveways or off-street parking areas must provide the commission with scaled site plans, including all landscape and groundcover changes and information on any proposed lighting.

### **Driveways and Offstreet Parking: Guidelines**

1. When repairing an original or historical driveway, the repairs must retain and maintain the configuration of historically accurate wheeled driveways (wheel strips) and

alleys and use historically appropriate materials for such configuration.

2. Historically appropriate materials for construction of new driveways or repairs of an original or historical driveway shall include concrete, gravel, stone and clay.
3. Construct new driveways to conform with the spacing, width, materials and historical configuration that reflect historically appropriate driveways.
4. Locate new driveways so that a minimum of alteration to historic site features, such as landscaping, walkways, and retaining walls, is necessary. Avoid damage to historic curbs and sidewalks.
5. Use driveways to access side and rear parking areas and garages.
6. Locate new parking areas as unobtrusively as possible in rear yards whenever possible.
7. It is not appropriate to locate off-street parking in front yards.
8. It is not appropriate to locate off-street parking in the side yard if the area would be visible from the street or the front yard.
9. It is not appropriate to store abandoned or inoperable vehicles in front yards.
10. For new parking areas, use paving material that is compatible with traditional paving materials for driveways in the district.
11. Screen all new parking areas from adjoining properties with fencing or shrubbery.
12. Incorporate existing mature trees into the new parking areas whenever possible, and introduce new trees to maintain tree canopy.
13. It is not appropriate to create large off-street parking areas encompassing so much of the rear yard that the residential character of the site is lost.
14. It is not appropriate to abut new driveways or parking areas directly to the principal structure.
15. In lighting parking areas, follow the guidelines for exterior lighting in the district.
16. Design lighting levels for safety. Use unobtrusive, directional lighting fixtures to avoid spilling light onto adjacent properties. For nonresidential parking areas, use lighting fixtures that turn off automatically after business hours, if possible.

### **State Historic Preservation Office Regional Training Update**

Mr. Wisemiller: The State Historic Preservation Office Regional Training Update will be on June 20, 2008 from 9:00 a.m. until 12:30 p.m. Topics are being finalized with the State Historic Preservation Office.

### **Discussion of 403 Maple Street (Wooten House)**

Mr. Wisemiller: Scott Power of the State Historic Preservation Office made the following observations concerning the Wooten House at 403 Maple Street.

Mr. Power: The Wooten House is an excellent example for a Georgian Revival style and it was designed by a regional prominent architect from Wilson named Tommy Herman. The style is denoted by its overall symmetry and classically-inspired elements such as pediments and multi-light sash windows. In this type of composition, balance



and symmetry are paramount so the removal of the left hand chimney did have a negative impact on the overall design and integrity of the historic house.

The Design Review Committee agreed to meet with Dr. Wooten to discuss this issue.

### **Update on Non-Complaint Historic Properties**

Mr. Wisemiller: I have distributed a list of the Non-Compliant Historic Properties.

At 2909 Memorial Drive, enforcement is in progress until violation remedied or official appeal is submitted. A total of \$1,400.00 in fines has been issued to date.

At 401 South Jarvis Street, the owner has constructed the screens/housing units, but enforcement remains online (\$2,400 in fines to date) until full completion (paint must still be applied); beginning May 12, 2008, the Director permitted a 3-week hiatus in enforcement to allow the wood to cure before painting; if the project is not complete by June 2, enforcement will resume.

At 1101 Johnston Street, owner began painting the fence in May but was interrupted by rain; staff will visit the property the week of May 27-30 to check status.

At 805 Evans Street, work not yet initiated; owner has been issued first series of fines, which will escalate until the property is in compliance.

At 707 East Fourth Street, staff requests direction from Historic Preservation Commission: MWCOA or COA review.

At 801 East Fourth Street, unless staff is presented with evidence that replacement was inappropriate, the work will be considered to fall under MWCOA.

### **Resolution on more staffing**

Ms. Pearce: Concerns have been raised from Historic Preservation Commission members about the amount of staff time given to the Commission. Mr. Merrill Flood, Director of Community Development, has written a memorandum to the Commission.

## MEMORANDUM

TO: Candace Pearce, Chairperson of the Historic Preservation Commission  
Historic Preservation Commission Members

FROM: Merrill Flood, Community Development Director

DATE: May 19, 2008

SUBJECT: **Historic Preservation Commission Staffing**

Over the past few months, I have received concerns from several members of the Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) regarding the staffing levels assigned by the Community Development Department to HPC related activities. Those concerns have also been expressed to the City Manager's Office who in turn have forwarded them to my attention. I would like to take this opportunity to respond to those concerns, as well as to provide an update on my efforts to increase the service levels available to the HPC.

As many of you are aware, the Community Development Department was assigned Primary responsibility for carrying out the implementation of the Center City – West Greenville Revitalization Plan which was adopted in January of 2006. While we are proud to be an integral part of this important work, we have assumed these duties without adding staff. In an effort to move forward with revitalization activities, I authorized a series of internal changes to our departmental work assignments, which subsequently paired the staffing of the HPC with that of the Redevelopment Commission under our newly formed Urban Development Division. While that Combination appeared to be successful early on, it has become increasingly apparent over the last year that the workload for the Urban Development Division, particularly that of Mr. Tom Wisemiller, who serves a dual role as a redevelopment planner as well as the City's Historic Preservation Officer, has exceeded the capacity of one employee.

Given these circumstances, I have sought and been granted authorization by the City Manager to investigate the possibility of procuring an outside contractor to assist with a number of HPC related duties. Although I have not finalized any plans related to this matter at the time of this correspondence, I expect that within the next month or so to contract with an outside consultant with extensive experience in Historic Preservation. In discussing this concept with my Urban Development Division staff, we have reached the conclusion that such assistance could provide a cost effective way to ensure that the monthly tasks of the HPC are completed in an efficient and timely manner, thus allowing the City staff members to dedicate additional time to some of the special projects and information requests that originate from the HPC as well as from our citizens.

We will provide the HPC membership with additional updates on this initiative as events warrant. In the interim, please do not hesitate to contact me at 329-4500 or Mr. Carl Rees of my staff at 329-4510 should you have any questions or require additional information.

cc: Mr. Wayne Bowers, City Manager  
Mr. Thom Moton, Assistant City Manager  
Mr. Carl Rees, Urban Development Planner

Motion was made by Mr. Jeremy Jordan and seconded by N. Yaprak Savut to support the memorandum by Merrill Flood. Motion carried unanimously.

Ms. Pearce: I would like to submit the following resolution.

**RESOLUTION OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION  
OF THE CITY OF GREENVILLE REQUESTING ADDITIONAL STAFFING FROM  
COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT TO BE ASSIGNED TO THE HISTORIC  
PRESERVATION COMMISSION**

WHEREAS, the Historic Preservation Commission was established to act as both a historic district and historic landmarks commission for the City of Greenville;

WHEREAS, Community Development assigned an urban planner to assist the Historic Preservation Commission in exercising and performing the preservation commission's many duties and responsibilities as provided in the ordinance establishing the Historic Preservation Commission;

WHEREAS, Community Development has acknowledged that the urban planner also has been assigned to perform duties for the Redevelopment Commission in addition to the duties previously assigned to assist the Historic Preservation Commission and that the workload has exceeded the capacity of that urban planner; and

WHEREAS, the assigned urban planner is not sufficient to perform the many and necessary duties required to ensure compliance with federal, state and local laws, statues and ordinances concerning historic properties;

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED by the Historic Preservation Commission of the City of Greenville that it does hereby request the City Council to direct Community Development to assign additional personnel resources to assist the Historic Preservation Commission in performing the tasks and directives of the Historic Preservation Commission.

This the \_\_\_\_\_ day of May, 2008.

Candace Pearce, Chairperson  
Historic Preservation Commission

ATTEST:

\_\_\_\_\_, Secretary

Motion was made by Mr. Rick Smiley and seconded by Mr. Jeremy Jordan to approve the resolution requesting additional staffing from the Community Development Department to be assigned to the Historic Preservation Commission. Motion carried unanimously.

**ANNOUNCEMENTS/OTHER**

Candace Pearce: There will have to be a green street sign placed at the Library. One will say Evans Street and one will say Dickinson Avenue. Public Works makes these signs. Is it possible to have something on that street sign that designates Dickinson Avenue Historic District?

Carl Rees: I'll check with Public Works.

**ADJOURNMENT**

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned.

Respectfully submitted,

Thomas G. Wisemiller  
Planner II